news-press.com

Jobs - Cars - Real Estate - Apartments - Classified - Shopping - Calendar - Weather



NEWS

Local & State

- Bonita Springs
- Cape Coral
- Estero Fort Myers
- Lehigh Acres
- North Fort Myers
- San Carlos Park South Fort Myers

Local News (by topic)

- Education Environment

- Growth & Dev
 Hurricane Issues
- Legislature '06
- Obituaries

Sports 5 4 1

- Golf Outdoors
- Prep Sports
- Lifestyles
- Celebrations **Business**

Opinion

Blogs

Columnists

Forums

Nation & World Health & Fitness

Photo galleries

Archives

ENTERTAINMENT

Arts & Theater **Beaches** Boating & Fishing Dating Destinations Dining Movies Music: VibeWire Travel

SERVICES

Email News Mobile News News Feeds Text Messaging ARCHIVE SEARCH

Search

Click for Savings Over \$7 Million **96 HOMES 96 HOURS** ANNUAL INVENTORY SALE

No one agrees on how to keep costs down

By Joel Moroney

ADVERTISEMEN'

jmoroney@news-press.com

Originally posted on June 26, 2006

Consolidation.

It has been talked about since the 1970s.

Mulled over in fire departments from Lehigh to Upper Captiva.

Hashed over at the union hall.

Studied by the county

Analyzed by the newspaper.

Considered when Lee County's 22 fire chiefs meet to discuss local fire protection.

Everyone has an opinion.

Hardly anyone agrees what, if anything, should be done to provide better, more economical fire protection in the

Lee relies on a county-run ambulance service, municipal departments in Fort Myers and Cape Coral, a county department at the airport, and 17 independent fire districts governed by elected fire boards with the power to tax your property.

"We've taken the bullets out of their pistol, pretty much," Iona-McGregor Chief Gerald Adema said of arguments in favor of consolidation. "A lot of things that are supposed to make us more efficient and effective, we've pretty much done over the years.'

To the man, chiefs say the county departments work extremely well together.

"We've been able to take the best parts of consolidation ... and put all these things into practice and yet keep our individual identities," San Carlos Chief Nat Ippolito said.

They point to hurricane recovery; a joint Urban Search and Rescue Team that was charged with protecting the East Coast from Washington, D.C., to Key West while other teams responded to Hurricane Katrina on the Gulf Coast; mutual aid agreements and joint brush fire strike teams as proof of the collaboration that has 22 departments acting as one in emergencies.

"I don't know anyone in the county who squabbles over the fire lines," Bonita Chief Dan Gourley said. "If someone has an emergency, we come to their aid."

And they contend the depth brought by large numbers of command staff is an asset during natural disasters such as Hurricane Charley.

"We throw away all the titles, but since we have a depth of officers we have a lot of people capable of making decisions," North Fort Myers Chief Terry Pye said. "A large countywide department only has a few decision makers at the top and they (could) get overwhelmed very

"We can bring that force."

And they point to Lee County's explosive growth and



Fort Myers Shores firefighter-EMT Robert Rewis, 20, right, examines a medical history for Mary Norman, 78, of the Villa Vicente community while engineer Jimmy Burrell, 37, left, and firefighter-EMT Mike Mann, 26, take vital signs during a recent medical call. The majority of calls run by the department are medical. A growing population of elderly in Fort Myers Shores ensures their workload will increase dramatically.

Order Picture

ALSO FROM NEWS-PRESS.COM

- ▶ Download it: Interactive map of fire districts in Lee Readers' forum: Should anything be done to
- change the structure of Lee County's fire districts?
- ▶ Reader's forum Bonita has the most expensive fire department in Lee
- Readers' forum: Cape Coral fire department may be a bargain
- Readers' forum: Auditors: Estero fire on shaky
- financial ground Readers' forum: FM chief says rising budgets
- mean big trouble ▶ Readers' forum: Should Lehigh fire return some of
- tax windfall? ■ Readers' forum: NFM served some of poorest fire districts in Lee
- Readers' forum: San Carlos fire budget up about 30 percent
- Readers' forum: SFM served by wealthy fire departments
- Special report: Fires and money
- Fire costs not equal
- Cape Coral fire department costs less than others
- Bonita Springs has county's richest fire district Lehigh Acres Fire District nearly triples budget
- Estero fire spending leaves unanswered questions
- Fort Myers fire chief sees future problems North Fort Myers fire districts among county's
- San Carlos Park fire budget up by about 30 percent Two South Fort Myers fire districts among county's
- wealthiest Union moves to control wages and benefits
- Voter education key to change, analysts say
- Similarly sized Volusia in favor of consolidations
- Merger proposals historically unpopular
- Documents, databases available for review by residents
- Spending skyrockets
- Cape Coral fire department costs less than others
- Bonita Springs has county's richest fire district
- Lehigh Acres Fire District nearly triples budget
- Estero fire spending leaves unanswered questions
- Fort Myers fire chief sees future problems



Mercedes HOMES





BILLING CLERK -The Aerial Companies in **Naples**

CUSTOMER SERVICE REPRESENTATIVE Ft

SOUTHWEST FLORIDA COLLEGE

DENTAL TREATMENT COORDINATOR

FRONT OFFICE

All Top Jobs

About Top Jobs

1 of 4 6/26/2006 1:20 PM The News-Press: Local & State

increased demands since 9/11 as primary reasons for ballooning budgets.

"Fire department is a misnomer." Bayshore Chief Chad Jorgensen said. "When people don't know who else to call, they call us. Our biggest fans are people who didn't give a crud about us until they needed us.

The chiefs believe the only way to stop the runaway budgets is to stop the growth — not consolidate.

According to the most recent county impact-fee study, population grew about 51 percent from 1990 to 2004, from 335,113 to 508,334.

Calls for service climbed from 40,243 in 2002 to 51,954

Yet district budgets have exploded by 300 percent since 1998.

"This is going to be a Fort Lauderdale — we're only 10 years from that," Fort Myers Shores Chief Chris Dowaliby said. "If we don't start to plan to provide those services, we're going to be behind the eight ball. I think that's what the districts are trying to do and why consolidation is an issue again.'

Bokeelia resident Bill Dubin, 76, is leaving town for Tennessee. Tired of hurricanes. Tired of traffic. And tired of what he calls his "backwoods" fire district on Pine Island

"There should be a consolidated fire district for the whole county," Dubin said. "What happens is the union plays a game every year, putting one fire district against another to increase wages and benefits."

He remembers it's not been so long ago the county looked at consolidating — yet again — but nothing came of it.



Michael Reitmann

County study

In 1997, the county spent \$187,000 to study whether consolidating its 22 fire departments made sense.

The results found it would cost nearly \$10 million more o operate one large department.

Today, that is often the first stone cast by those opposed to consolidation

■ North Fort Myers fire districts among county's poorest

- ▶ San Carlos Park fire budget up by about 30 percent
- ▶ Two South Fort Myers fire districts among county's wealthiest
- Problems uncovered in fractured fire districts
- Extra assets at calls embarrassing, county manager says
- Fire audit problems paid scant attention
- Four-month study looks at figures on fire districts
- Cape Coral
- Bonita Springs
- Lehigh Acres
- Estero
- Fort Myers
- North Fort Myers San Carlos Park
- South Fort Myers
- Photo Gallery: Estero Fire Department
- ▶ Photo Gallery: Fort Myers Shores Fire Department
- ■Photo Gallery: Alva Fire Department
- Photo Gallery: San Carlos Park Fire Department

MULTIMEDIA

- ▶ Listen: Download: Exec. editor Kate Marymont on news-press.com's role in investigative reporting
- Listen: <u>Download</u>: Exec. editor Kate Marymont talks about The News-Press' fire district investigation ■ Download it: Searchable database of fire districts in

DELIVERING YOUR WORLD

- Subscribe to The News-Press
- Join our reader panel
- Printer friendly version
- · Email this article



which is the vast majority of fire chiefs in Lee County.

After all, they operate their own departments, answer only to their elected boards to collect property taxes, and preside over budgets that have doubled and tripled in the last decade — sometimes in just a year or two, thanks to skyrocketing property values.

But a closer look at the study reveals an initial cost increase was a given based on three assumptions:

- * That no stations would close.
- * That no firefighters would be laid off.
- * And that wages would be equalized by raising lower-paying districts to a level comparable to wages in wealthier

The real question is whether it would be cheaper today, nearly 10 years later.

At the time of the study in 1997. Lee County's independent fire districts with property-taxing authority spent \$54.5 million on fire protection.

This year they will spend nearly triple that amount — \$147.8 million.

But whether one large county department would be more efficient is an outcome no one agrees on.

"The budgets have increased by 300 percent in 10 years. That should be a wake-up call to all of us," County Manager Don Stilwell said. "Maybe we are spending exactly what we need to, but it behooves us to take a look."

Michael Reitmann, executive vice president of the Building Industry Association, believes the system is outdated.

Reitmann lobbies on behalf of builders against impact fees — fees fire departments charge new construction to purchase equipment, build stations and help deal with growth.

"It's just a very antiquated, inefficient system. I don't care what they say. We're not against fire protection. It's essential," Reitmann said. "Many of them have duplicate fire services, training facilities and fire equipment. The fire

2 of 4

The News-Press: Local & State

unions have literal control over salaries. They are totally redundant and could be consolidated."

Yet not a single independent fire chief believes it would be cheaper to operate a countywide department.

They point to the huge cost of schools and the waste and inefficiencies they believe would be inherent in a large metro system.

"They don't keep pace with the growth. They don't buy equipment like they should," said Jim Brantley, area vice president for Florida Professional Firefighters. "There are things that get lost in the sauce when you get that big. I'm not interested in seeing the good dollars people are paying for fire service thrown into that kitty and shaken out 60 cents on the dollar."

While the union admits there are opportunities for savings being missed, such as cooperating on a central maintenance facility, it doubts that consolidation offers real solutions.

"On the surface it is a dysfunctional way to do this ... and I do think there are things we could do to make better use of tax dollars," Brantley said. "But that doesn't mean everything we do is bad and that consolidation is the only answer."

But even horse-drawn fire wagons needed maintenance, and yet each district arranges service however it sees fit.

In Bayshore, the department gives a fire-maintenance provider cut-rate rent in exchange for servicing its equipment at a discount.

Several departments have their own mechanic. Some use a mechanic from the local garage.

They bid individually for fire engines. They arrange for construction of their own stations. And they pay separate insurance premiums.

"They know going in what their revenue is and look for ways to spend it," said Fort Myers Fire Chief Richard Chappelle Jr., whose department is funded through city council and not an independent board with taxing authority. "There should be a consolidated fire-service provider."

But most chiefs said they would have no interest in leading such a department, where they believe cost cutting would be the order of the day.

"I can't tell you that I agree that would be the best thing for the end user, but I can tell you that would be the walking papers," Jorgensen said. "At the end of the day, you still have to put the wet stuff on the red stuff and you still got to have firefighters to do it."

« Return to previous page

For similar stories search our paid archives dating back to 1999.

TOP HEADLINES FROM LOCAL & STATE

- Mailbag: Letters from the Cape
- Imperial Landings is logical
- Mailbag: Letters to the editor
- Mailbag: Letters from North Fort Myers
- Mailbag: Letters from Lehigh Acres

ALSO ON NEWS-PRESS.COM

- Traveling country one perk of circuit
- Star rises higher on branches of bonsai
- Marco Island handles convention crowds with ease
- · Lights, sirens, stop

To e-mail this article just enter the following information:

Recipient's e-mail:

Sender's name:

Sender's email:

Your comments:

Sender's email:

Your comments:

Partners: Jobs (CareerBuilder.com) - Cars (Cars.com) - Real Estate (Apartments.com) - Classified (news-press.com) - Shopping (ShopLocal.com)

Copyright 2006, The News-Press. Use of this site signifies your agreement to the <u>Terms of Service</u> and <u>Privacy Policy</u>, updated June 7, 2005. <u>Customer Service - Subscribe Now - Renew Subscription - Place a Classified Ad - Contact Us</u>

3 of 4 6/26/2006 1:20 PM







\n\n'); newWindow.document.write("); newWindow.document.close(); if (!newWindow.opener) newWindow.opener = self; // End hiding script from old browsers -->

4 of 4